

December 21, 2010

TO: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

FROM: Kris Brophy, SPHR
Director's Review Investigator

SUBJECT: Lailee Daling v. Wenatchee Valley College
Allocation Review Request ALLO-10-022

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to February 2, 2010, the date Wenatchee Valley College (WVC) Human Resource Division received Ms. Daling's request for a position review. As the Director's Review Investigator, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits, and the verbal comments provided by both parties during the review telephone conference. Based on my review and analysis of Ms. Daling's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude her position is properly allocated to the Library & Archives Paraprofessional 2 classification.

Background

On February 2, 2010, WVC's human resource office received Ms. Daling's cover letter (Exhibit B-2) and Position Review Request (PRR) form asking that her position be reallocated to the Library & Archival Professional 1 classification (Exhibit B-3). Ms. Daling signed the form on February 1, 2010. Her supervisor, Andrew Hersh-Tudor, completed but did not sign the supervisor's portion of the form.

On March 23, 2010 WVC notified Ms. Daling that her position was properly allocated as a Library and Archives Paraprofessional 2 (Exhibit B-1).

On April 22, 2010, the Department of Personnel received Ms. Daling's request for a Director's review of WSP's allocation determination (Exhibit A-1).

On November 3, 2010, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference. Present during the call were Lailee Daling, Lou Baker, Contract Administrator - WPEA, Reagan Bellamy, Executive Director of Human Resources.

The parties submitted additional information following the review telephone conference. The last submittal was submitted on December 7, 2010. This information has been added to the record as Director's exhibits.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

The purpose of Ms. Daling's position is to coordinate the circulation services for the John A. Brown Library at WVC. She is responsible for maintaining daily library operations at the circulation desk which includes helping patrons find library materials, checking materials in and out of the library, organizing stacks and re-shelving materials, managing magazines and journals, maintaining catalog records, and processing all new materials for use by patrons. Ms. Daling trains and directs the work of work-study and Skills Source students.

Ms. Daling's supervisor, Andrew Hersh-Tudor, Director of Library and Distance Learning, indicated that the description of work provided in the PRR by Ms. Daling accurately reflects her duties and responsibilities.

Ms. Daling's assigned duties and responsibilities as stated in the PRR include:

- 40% Circulation duties: check-in and check-out materials to students and staff. Perform complex circulation functions: make authorized decisions regarding exceptional circumstances, exceptions to normal policy, waiver of limitations, and interpretation of policies; print, place holds and mail fines and fees, when necessary prepare evidence for appeals to library fines.
- 20% Cataloging: Working in the catalog module in order to delete materials that are being weeded, then stamp "discard" and in some cases look for a buyer of discarded materials or ready them for a book sale. Working in OCLC to delete holdings information. New materials; check cataloging to ensure that information is correct and that all information matches the selected material. Working in OCLC to place holdings on new materials.
- 15% Work study: Interviewing, hiring and training, and when necessary disciplining, work-study students on a quarterly basis. Supervising the students and scheduling hours to match the needs of the library and the students' class schedules. Working directly with students on a daily basis to keep them on task with the duties of the library, on-going training and supervision, reviewing work of students and making necessary corrections or additional training. Monthly time-sheets are collected and totaled, then sent to Financial Services.
- 10% Journal Acquisitions: maintain purchasing information, shelving and processing of all journals and magazines. Creating new records, deleting old records and determining what to archive and for how long by determining what is available on current databases and speaking with the instructor or department head for each subject.

- 4% Material Maintenance: Shelving of materials that are returned, processing new materials, stamping binding, covering, and security striping. Mending books as necessary.
- 3% Materials purchases and & requisitions: Typing requisitions for materials that are needed for library services and maintaining an updated inventory. Perform purchasing reconciliation on a monthly basis of purchases made on VISA and complete paperwork for financial services, verifying that what was purchased has been received.
- 3% Provide support and training to staff and students on the uses and capabilities of current library databases and materials available to them.
- 3% Creating visual displays to enhance books and materials available in library, creating signage to help patrons and staff create an overall inviting and informative atmosphere.
- 2% Troubleshoot printer, copier and electronic problems, identifying computer repair problems and giving IT the necessary information for repair services on student computers and printers.

Summary of Ms. Daling's Perspective

Ms. Daling asserts that her duties have expanded and increased beyond the requirements of her current class and are better described by the Library and Archives Paraprofessional 4 or 5, or the Library and Archival Professional 1 class. This includes her work helping students with citing bibliographic information using various citation styles; conducting bibliographic information searches and helping with research questions; maintaining, updating and deleting catalog records; maintaining periodical acquisitions, and maintaining and cataloging materials placed on reserve by instructors throughout the year.

Summary of Wenatchee Valley College's Reasoning

WVC asserts the preponderance of Ms. Daling's work falls within the Library and Archives Paraprofessional 2 class. WVC contends the duties Ms. Daling describes are either within her present classification or did not occur frequently enough to be a preponderance of her overall job duties. During the review telephone conference, Ms. Bellamy stated she acknowledges Ms. Daling does perform some specialized duties but as a whole her position serves as a generalist which best fits within the Library and Archives Paraprofessional 2 class.

Comparison of Duties to Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by the definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

Comparison of Duties to Library And Archival Professional 1

The Category Concept for Library And Archival Professional 1 states in relevant part:

Positions in this series perform professional librarian or archivist duties in the State Library and its library service sites, the State Archives, as well as libraries or archives within other agencies. Conduct bibliographic and informational searches, write manuals, technical bulletins, and training information, assist customers in locating information, assist in collection assessment, development, and preservation, conduct research projects and provide cataloging and indexing of library collections. Positions plan and implement strategic initiatives and perform analysis, design, development and/or support for large technology applications vital to program delivery. ...

The Definition for Library And Archival Professional 1 states:

Performs entry-level professional librarian duties. Positions perform basic library functions and provide professional level services. Provides day-to-day implementation of effective customer service, technical services and/or collection management. Assignments are structured to encourage the development of professional judgment and learn the full range and scope of library management functions conducted by the employing agency.

There are no Distinguishing Characteristics for this class.

The overall thrust of Ms. Daling's position is to independently provide technical library services work. The majority of her work involves overseeing and directing the daily circulation activities within the John Brown Library. While a portion of her work falls within the scope of this class, her position does not encompass the full range and scope of responsibility for performing professional library management functions as required.

Through the course of her daily activities, primarily during the absence of the reference librarian, Ms. Daling assists patrons with locating bibliographic information and developing bibliographic citations. During the review telephone conference, Mr. Baker stated that Ms. Daling covers for the librarian when she is not on the floor and helps students with their bibliographic citations. He stated that she conducts independent bibliographic or citation referencing. Ms. Daling stated she helps students determine the correct reference sources and citation styles to use based on the student's class. She uses her knowledge of citation styles to help the students make proper citations for their reference projects. She helps students determine the validity of the web or database they are using to make sure it is a referenced source.

She stated that the most complex aspect of this work occurs when instructors ask for certain citation styles. If she's not in contact with the particular faculty member she will go to the Director or the librarian to make sure she gets the right citation style for the student.

Ms. Daling's responsibilities do not fully reach the level of responsibility for collection writing manuals, technical bulletins, and training information as required. Ms. Daling stated during the review telephone conference that she has responsibility for writing policies for the Library policies manual, and that she developed the Work study student procedures. She also developed a tips sheet for the circulation desk. She also worked on flyers for MLA and

APA citation styles with the librarian. She does not have responsibility for writing technical bulletins and training information at the level anticipated by this class.

Ms. Daling states in the PRR that she spends approximately 20% of her time providing skilled technical support in locating, revising, updating and/or creating catalog records. Ms. Daling states in Exhibit B2 that she deletes and updates the catalog records in the OCLC to help decrease the workload for the cataloger during a large project to update the library's reference materials. Ms. Daling clarified during the review telephone conference that the library has been going under major reconstruction and her unit has been undergoing a major project of removing out of date materials and purchasing new reference materials to keep the reference information current. It is a multi-step process involving multiple staff. Ms. Daling is responsible for pulling circulation reports for usage to determine usage rates, and she checks for proper indexing and to see how much the reference material is used. However, the cataloging function is principally performed by the unit's cataloger. This limits Ms. Daling's responsibility for performing the cataloging function.

Ms. Daling stated in Exhibit B2 that she maintains the periodical acquisitions module in "Voyager," the library's internal database system. This involves entering weekly, monthly subscriptions as they arrive, and deleting old records. Ms. Daling stated during the review telephone conference that she is responsible for maintaining and cataloging new journals and materials that faculty place on reserve that the library does not have. Ms. Daling works with another staff member who designates the appropriate section and Ms. Daling enters the information and puts the materials into their designated sections.

While portions of Ms. Daling's work falls within the scope of this class, her position does not encompass the full range and scope of overall responsibility for performing entry-level professional library management functions as required. The focus of Ms. Daling's duties involves providing skilled technical work in support of the circulation desk function within the John Brown Library. In support of that function Ms. Daling performs certain higher level duties. However, these duties are secondary in nature to her primary responsibility for directing circulation services and supporting bibliographic and cataloging activities performed by higher-level paraprofessional and professional staff within the library.

While a portion of Ms. Daling's assigned duties fall within the Library And Archives Professional 1 description of duties, the preponderance of her assignments were not performed at this level for a majority of time as required. Certain portions of her bibliographic work involving searches with patrons, problem resolution and citations reach aspects of customer-related and technical services contained in the definition. Similarly, Ms. Daling's work cataloging and indexing reference materials and periodicals reach aspects of collection management. However, these duties are not the focus of her position and she does not fully perform this work at the level anticipated by this class for more than 50% of the time for the time period under review. For these reasons Ms. Daling's position should not be reallocated to the Library And Archives Professional 1 class specification.

Comparison of Duties to Library And Archives Paraprofessional Series

The Category Concept for Library And Archival Paraprofessional states:

Library & Archives Paraprofessionals perform a wide variety of tasks in the delivery of library or archival services offered by universities or colleges, the State Library, the State Archives, or other state agencies or institutions. These may range from

basic tasks at the entry level to complex technical work and problem solving at the higher levels. Some positions in this series supervise assigned personnel and maintain or direct the operations of library or archives units or functions. Perform library or archival technical tasks such as assist clients with reference, informational, bibliographic or archival questions, perform circulation and collection maintenance and preservation functions, perform a range of acquisition and receipts functions, perform interlibrary lending and document delivery functions, perform a range of cataloging functions, input/update library records or archival databases, stay current with library or archives standards, practices, and technology, maintain the operations of library or archives units or functions, and participate in the development and implementation of policies. At the higher levels perform complex library technical work involving intensive application of specialized knowledge and skills.

Ms. Daling's position performs technical library tasks in support of the circulation function for the John Brown Library and therefore should be allocated to a class within the Library And Archival Paraprofessional series.

Comparison of Duties to Library And Archives Paraprofessional 4

The Definition for this class states:

This is the first expert/supervisor level of the series. Performs complex technical library or archival tasks using intensive application of specialized knowledge and skills, such as search bibliographic or complex reference resources, perform complex cataloging of library or archival materials with catalog copy, analyze and resolve complex order, bibliographic or archival problems, assist clients with reference services including interpreting and conferring on research strategies and assisting the management and preservation of the collection.

OR

Supervises assigned personnel and maintains the operations of a library unit or function.

Although the Typical Work examples do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification. The following provides an example of the level of work assigned to the class, as stated on the Library And Archives Paraprofessional 4 class specification:

Performs complex cataloging of library materials with catalog copy from sources such as Library of Congress (LC), Cataloging in Publication (CIP), National Library of Medicine (NLM), and G Union Catalog; complete and upgrade records which require classification, subject analysis, and extensive descriptive changes; correct or add subjects or classification to general copy cataloging;

Analyze and resolve complex order and bibliographic or archival cataloging problems; maintain and update internal records using complex automated systems;

Performs bibliographic and reference searches in the area of specialization using knowledge of complex reference resources, including interpreting and conferring on reference research strategies with clients;

Do pre- or post-search of materials ordered or received in area of specialization; correspond with publishers and vendors; identifies and resolves problems with suppliers;

Assists in the management and preservation of the library collections in the specialty area;

Analyzes, organizes, indexes, and describes materials such as manuscripts, clippings, slides, and photographs in area of specialization;

Monitor and oversee stacks maintenance and space allotment;

Monitor assigned budgets, cash receipts and funds;

Positions at this level serve as experts and perform complex technical library or archival tasks using intensive application of specialized knowledge and skills in a specialized area. Ms. Daling's overall duties do not rise to the level of expertise required by this class.

This class describes positions which perform complex cataloging of library materials with catalog copy from various sources. This includes responsibility for completing and upgrading records which require classification, subject analysis, and making extensive descriptive changes. Ms. Daling does not have this level of responsibility. Ms. Daling provides skilled technical support in locating, revising, updating and/or creating catalog records. Ms. Daling stated that with regard to the cataloging project, she is responsible for pulling circulation reports for usage to determine usage rates, and she checks for proper indexing and to see how much the reference material is used. However, the cataloging function is principally performed by the unit's cataloger. This limits Ms. Daling's responsibility for performing the cataloging function.

Ms. Daling states in the PRR that she spends approximately 3% of her time providing support and training to staff and students on the uses and capabilities of the library's databases and reference materials available to them. In the review telephone conference, Ms. Daling stated she shows students the proper use of key word searches, how to input the appropriate words, and how to determine the appropriate source information.

While Ms. Daling assists patrons with locating bibliographic information and developing bibliographic citations, she does not perform complex bibliographic and reference searches in an area of specialization. Ms. Daling assists students in determining correct reference sources and citation styles. She uses her knowledge of citation styles to help the student make proper citations for their reference projects. She helps students determine the validity of the web or database they are using to make sure it is a referenced source. This does not reach the Library And Archive Paraprofessional 4 level of responsibility of using complex reference resources and interpreting and conferring on reference research strategies with clients.

Positions at this level serve as experts and perform complex technical library or archival tasks using intensive application of specialized knowledge and skills in a specialized area.

Ms. Daling's overall duties do not rise to the level of expertise required by this class.

Comparison of duties to the Library And Archive Paraprofessional 3

The Definition for this class states:

Leadworker level of the series. Leads assigned staff and functions as a fully qualified library technician, and performs journey level technical library tasks or serves as a functional specialist in a conservation/preservation unit by leading staff or directing the operation of the unit. Regularly assigns, instructs and checks the work of others. May supervise and train lower level library technicians, clerical staff, temporary or resident clerical staff, volunteers, or interns.

In the DOP, "Glossary of Classification Terms," the term "Lead" is defined as follows: "An employee who performs the same or similar duties as other employees in his/her work group and has the designated responsibility to regularly assign, instruct, and check the work of those employees on an ongoing basis." [Emphasis added] Because the Definition permissively allows the supervision of lower level library technicians or other lower-level staff, incumbents must lead equivalent-level library technicians. Ms. Daling does not have responsibility for leading the work of equivalent-level paraprofessional staff within the John Brown Library. For this reason her position is precluded from allocation to this class.

Comparison of duties to the Library And Archive Paraprofessional 2

The Definition for this class states:

Functions as a fully qualified, library technician performing journey level technical library tasks for a college library, a library service site, or other state agency library. Positions work independently and exercise judgment and discretion in determining the scope or level of service. Work is typically reviewed on a spot check basis after decisions have been made. Unusual problems that may occur are brought to a higher level librarian with probable outcomes and solutions. May supervise and train lower level library technicians, clerical staff, temporary or resident clerical staff, volunteers, or interns.

The following provides an example of the level of work assigned to the class, as stated on the Library And Archives Paraprofessional 2 class specification:

Searches and verifies library material orders and receipts using manual and/or automated systems, catalogs of the Library of Congress, the National Union Catalog, and other bibliographic sources;

Catalogs library materials using close catalog copy from sources such as Library of Congress (LC), Online Computer Library Center (OCLC), Cataloging in Publication

(CIP), National Library of Medicine (NLM), and Research Libraries Information Network (RLIN); transcribes information for review;

Prepares regular statistical reports;

Conducts library orientations; produces displays;

Performs complex circulation functions; make authorized decisions regarding exceptional circumstances such as waiver of fines, exceptions to normal policy, waiver of limitations, and interpretation of policies; prepare library evidence for appeals of library fines;

Prepares and participates in the delivery of programs for institutional, school, or correctional center residents; assists in providing outreach services including training and orientations;

Processes resource sharing requests such as interlibrary lending, borrowing, or document delivery, including verifying bibliographic citations;

Processes and maintains records of library materials such as books, government documents, periodicals, newspapers, audio-visual, and other non-print media;

Identifies, verifies, and processes complex added copies/volumes or reserve materials; inputs and/or revises catalog records in local, regional, national, or international databases using specific knowledge of appropriate cataloging rules, machine readable coding, and local practice; maintains holding records;

Initiates and answers specified correspondence resolving special problems or inquires; compiles and prepares reports;

Orders replacement materials; discards and withdraws items identified by professional staff as not needed for collection; reinstates and relocates materials;

May supervise lower level staff.

Ms. Daling's position closely matches the Definition of the Library And Archives Paraprofessional 2 classification.

Ms. Daling independently directs the operations of the circulation services for the John Brown Library. The overall scope and purpose of her position, and the majority of her duties as a whole, is to maintain the daily operations at the library's circulation desk. Her duties include responsibility for helping patrons find library materials, checking materials in and out of the library, organizing stacks and re-shelving materials, managing magazines and journals, maintaining catalog records, and processing all new materials for use by patrons. Many of her duties are fully described by the typical work statements for this class. Ms. Daling works independently and exercises judgment and discretion in determining the scope or level of service for circulation desk activities. Her work is typically reviewed on a

spot check basis, or once decisions have been made. Unusual circulation issues or problems that may occur are brought to a higher level librarian or her supervisor.

WVC submitted a summary of hours worked for the work study students who provided circulation desk coverage and worked under Ms. Daling's direction for the review time period (Exhibit D-1). Ms. Daling submitted additional information regarding the supervision of three Skills Source students during the review time period (Exhibit D-2). The college acknowledged Ms. Daling provided staff supervision of the three skills source students during the summer portion of the review time period. Based on the records provided by the parties, the full time equivalency of all students for which she provided work direction is more than 1 FTE. This is addressed in the Definition of this class which states, "May supervise and train lower level library technicians, clerical staff, temporary or resident clerical staff, volunteers, or interns."

Ms. Daling's overall level of responsibility and decision making authority, as well as her responsibility for coordinating the circulation services activities for the John Brown Library fit within the Library and Archives Paraprofessional 2 classification.

When determining the appropriate classification for a specific position, the duties and responsibilities of that position must be considered in their entirety and the position must be allocated to the classification that provides the best fit overall for the majority of the position's duties and responsibilities. Dudley v. Dept. of Labor and Industries, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-07-007 (2007).

In this case, the majority of the duties assigned to Ms. Daling's position and her level of responsibility and delegated authority are best described by the Library And Archives Paraprofessional 2 classification. Ms. Daling's position should remain allocated to that class.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located at 600 South Franklin, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 664-0388, and the fax number is (360) 753-0139.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Lou Baker
 Reagan Bellamy, WVC
 Lisa Skriletz, DOP

Lailee Daling v. Wenatchee Valley College (ALLO-10-022)

A. Lailee Daling Exhibits

1. Request for Director's Review from Lailee Daling, date stamped into DOP on April 22, 2010.

B. Wenatchee Valley College cover letter from Reagan Bellamy, dated May 27, 2010 with enclosed exhibits:

1. Allocation determination letter to Lailee Daling from Reagan Bellamy dated March 23, 2010.
2. Cover letter to the position review request from Lailee Daling dated January 27, 2010.
3. Position Review Request from Lailee Daling, with employee signature dated February 1, 2010. (Note: This was received by WVC HR April 2, 2010 – verified by Reagan Bellamy during telephone review conference).
4. Position Review Request - Supervisor section - unsigned.
5. Position Announcement for Library Technician III, posted October 30, 2004.
6. Desk Audit notes from Reagan Bellamy titled, "Reallocation Questions".

C. Class Specifications

1. DOP Class Specification for Library Archives And Paraprofessional 1
2. DOP Class Specification for Library Archives And Paraprofessional 2
3. DOP Class Specification for Library Archives And Paraprofessional 3
4. DOP Class Specification for Library Archives And Paraprofessional 4
5. DOP Class Specification for Library And Archival Professional 1

D. Director's Exhibits

1. Email from Reagan Bellamy to Kris Brophy dated November 9, 2010, with attached spreadsheet of work study student hours for June 2009 through January 2010.
2. Email from Lailee Daling to Kris Brophy, dated November 10, 2010 providing clarification of work study hours indicated in work study spreadsheet.
3. Email from Reagan Bellamy to Kris Brophy, dated November 10, 2010 providing further clarification.
4. Email from Kris Brophy to Lailee Daling and Reagan Bellamy, dated November 29, 2010; requesting additional information.
5. Email from Lailee Daling to Kris Brophy, dated December 1, 2010; providing additional clarification.
6. Final email response from Reagan Bellamy to Kris Brophy, dated December 7, 2010; providing further clarification regarding supervision of student workers in the library for the time period under review.